

# MINUTES OF THE SYDNEY EAST REGIONAL PANEL MEETING HELD AT THE HABERFIELD LIBRARY ON WEDNESDAY, 15 SEPTEMBER 2010 AT 6:00 PM

## PRESENT:

John Roseth	Chair
David Furlong	Member
Mary-Lynne Taylor	Member
Ted Cassidy	Member
Lyall Kennedy	Member

## IN ATTENDANCE

Phil Sarin	Director Planning and Environment
Atalay Bas	Manager Development Services
Shakeeb Mushtaq	Specialist Planner

## APOLOGY: NIL

The meeting commenced at 6.00 pm

### 1. Declarations of Interest - Nil

### 2. Business Items

**ITEM 1 - 2010SYE028 Ashfield DA No. 10.2010.102.1 – Demolition of Murray House and Kindergarten building, removal of trees, restoration and refurbishment of buildings known as the Gorton, Emily Trollope Nursing Ward and the Louise Taplin Ward, construction of new buildings to accommodate a learning and development centre and child and family support services with a basement car park for 37 vehicles at 17 Henry and 185A Frederick Street, Ashfield.**

### 3. Public Submission -

Sean Marshall	addressed the Panel against the item, pointing out the importance of keeping Murray House
David Rollinson, heritage officer of the Ashfield and District Historical Society	addressed the Panel against of the item, making a similar point to Sean Marshall
Anita Kumar on behalf of the Ashfield Infants Home	Addressed the Panel pointing out the long involvement of her organisation with the site and its inability to stay if the development cannot proceed
Amanda Harvey, a planner of JBA Planning on behalf of the applicant	addressed the Panel in favour of the item arguing against the assessment report's recommendation for refusal
Stephen Davies, a heritage consultant	addressed the Panel in favour of the item

## 6. Business Item Recommendations

**2010SYE028 Ashfield DA No. 10.2010.102.1 – Demolition of Murray House and Kindergarten building, removal of trees, restoration and refurbishment of buildings known as the Gorton, Emily Trollope Nursing Ward and the Louise Taplin Ward, construction of new buildings to accommodate learning and development centre and child and family support services with a basement car park for 37 vehicles at 17 Henry and 185A Frederick Street, Ashfield.**

- 1) The Panel resolves, by a majority of 4:1 (for: John Roseth, Mary-Lynne Taylor, David Furlong and Ted Cassidy; against: Lyall Kennedy), not to accept the recommendation of the planning assessment report to refuse the application.
- 2) The Panel resolves to approve the application, subject to the conditions recommended by the elected council, as amended below:
  - a) Condition C1(b): 6 metres is changed to 5.5 metres.
  - b) Condition C1(c) is deleted.
  - c) Condition C12 Is deleted.
  - d) Condition C15: the last paragraph is deleted and the following substituted: *“Note: Subject to the final drainage design, the existing stormwater connections which discharge into 476 Parramatta Road may not be necessary.”*
  - e) Condition E19: the word *“building”* is deleted and *“new buildings”* is substituted.
  - f) Condition E22 is deleted.
  - g) Condition E23 is deleted.
  - h) Condition G1: the words *“detailing the”* are deleted and *“requiring the provision and maintenance of”* is substituted.
  - i) Condition G2(c): The words *“This is”* are deleted and *“and”* is substituted.
  - j) Condition H2: The word *“Friday”* is deleted and *“Sunday”* is substituted.
  - k) Condition H3 is deleted.
  - l) Condition H10: the last paragraph referring to staff numbers is deleted.
  - m) The following new condition is added: *“An additional tree of a species with a large canopy is to be planted in the northeast corner of Licence Area 1. The underground car park is to be re-designed to provide for the tree and amended plans submitted and approved by the PCA before the release of the Construction Certificate.”*
- 3) The reasons of the four Panel members for approving the application are:
  - a) they place major weight on the continuing use of the site by the Ashfield Infants Home;
  - b) they note that several of the heritage experts, including the Heritage Office, have agreed that Murray House may be demolished;
  - c) they believe that the proposed curtilage and the landscape treatment around the retained buildings are adequate;
  - d) they note the elected council’s submission that the application should be approved.
- 4) Lyall Kennedy voted for refusal of the application, despite the fact that he recognises the special importance of the Ashfield Infant’s Home, because in his opinion, the application in its current form will have a strong negative impact on the heritage significance of the site, both from a built form and a social point of view.

**MOTION CARRIED**

The meeting concluded at 8.00 pm.

Endorsed by

John Roseth  
Chair, Sydney East Region Planning Panel  
17 September 2010